Criteria for Peer Reviews of Teaching and
Nominations for Provost Awards for Innovations in Teaching

The following criteria should be used for reviewing Teaching Portfolios and composing the peer review letter for promotion dossiers. Reviewers should also consider the criteria used in the teaching observation. Departments may add criteria that they feel are particularly important in assessing teaching excellence in their field.

These criteria are also used to make recommendations for the Provost Awards for Innovations in Teaching. Based on the recommendations of departmental reviewers, these awards will be granted to candidates who have exemplary records of teaching innovations, including active learning strategies, well-defined learning outcomes, and strategies for creating inclusive classrooms and curricula that engage students from diverse backgrounds and with differing learning styles and aptitudes.

Overall Content
The Portfolio should document well-structured course syllabi, research on teaching and learning, evidence-based instructional innovations, attendance at workshops and other collaborations on teaching, strong TCE and student comments, teaching awards and grants, and efforts to support students from traditionally underserved backgrounds.

Teaching Statement
In their Candidate Statement and/or teaching statement, candidates should effectively introduce their Teaching Portfolio by noting the impact and effectiveness of their teaching. Candidates should describe their teaching goals, methods, learning assessments, mentoring, and efforts to foster inclusive learning. Candidates should also reflect on areas where improvements are needed and note efforts to address them.

Student Learning Outcomes
The Teaching Portfolio should clearly identify the learning outcomes for courses. These outcomes may be specified in the course syllabi that are included. These outcomes should be clear, measurable, and appropriate to the level of the course. Candidates should note the measures used to assess learning outcomes.

Evidence-Based Learning Strategies
The Teaching Portfolio should clearly identify the active learning strategies the candidates used in their courses, class discussions, student performances, clicker questions, in-class small-group activities, and group projects. Candidates should provide examples of how these strategies are used in their teaching.

Student Assessments
The Teaching Portfolio should clearly identify the ways in which the candidate assesses students’ attainment of the learning outcomes for each course. The assessment activities should be clear and well-aligned measures of course outcomes. Where appropriate, these assessments should also be aligned with program outcome assessments.

Professional Development and Leadership
The Teaching Portfolio should identify efforts to improve teaching and involvements in professional development around teaching. Such efforts may include participation in activities such as teaching workshops, OIA coaching, and education conferences. More advanced candidates should demonstrate leadership in collaborative efforts to improve teaching and advance curricular innovations.

Inclusive Curricula and Classrooms
Classroom observations, Candidate Statements, and other aspects of Teaching Portfolios should demonstrate that candidates are utilizing evidence-based methods such as universal design principles to meet the needs of all learners, including those from traditionally unrepresented backgrounds. Further information on inclusive pedagogies is available at https://diversity.arizona.edu/creating-inclusive-classrooms.